Message Text

SECRET

PAGE 01 NATO 08657 01 OF 04 100844Z ACTION ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 CIAE-00 EUR-12 H-01 INR-07 IO-13 L-03 NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-05 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 TRSE-00 NSC-05 /085 W

P 100821Z SEP 77 FM USMISSION NATO TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 5793 SECDEF WASHDC PRIORITY INFO USDEL MBFR VIENNA USNMR SHAPE BE

SECRET SECTION 01 OF 04 NATO 08657

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: PARM, MBFR, NATO

SUBJECT: MBFR: WORKING GROUP STUDY ON SECURITY

IMPLICATIONS OF RELEASE OF NATO AIR FORCES MANPOWER DATA

REF: NATO 8508 (DTG 070918Z SEP 77)

- 1. MBFR WORKING GROUP STAFF CIRCULATED SEPTEMBER 9 A REVISED VERSION OF SUBJECT STUDY TAKING INTO ACCOUNT POINTS RAISED REFTEL BY NETHERLANDS AND FRG. THE PAPER HAS BEEN REORGANIZED AND EXPANDED TO DISCUSS ANOMOLIES AND DESCRIBE SPECIFICALLY THOSE ASPECTS OF AIR MANPOWER DATA WHOSE RELEASE WOULD POSE NO SECURITY OBJECTION. ACTION REQUESTED: AUTHORITY TO APPROVE DRAFT WG REPORT BY OOB SEPTEMBER 20.
- 2. FOLLOWING IS TEXT OF WG DRAFT STUDY ON THE SECURITY IMPLICATIONS OF RELEASE OF NATO AIR FORCES MANPOWER DATA. BEGIN TEXT:

AT THE REQUEST (1) OF THE SENIOR POLITICAL COMMITTEE, THE MBFR WORKING GROUP HAVE UNDERTAKEN A STUDY OF THE SECURITY IMPLICATIONS OF RELEASING AIR MANPOWER DATA, SIMILAR TO SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 NATO 08657 01 OF 04 100844Z

THE STUDY (2) ON GROUND FORCES MANPOWER DATA. THE STUDY ADDRESSES AIR UNITS BELOW THE LEVEL OF MAJOR AIR FORMATIONS, AS WELL AS MAJOR AIR FORMATIONS.

BACKGROUND

2. THE MBFR WORKING GROUP PREVIOUSLY EXAMINES (2) THE SECURITY IMPLICATIONS OF RELEASE OF GROUND FORCES MAN-

POWER DATA TO THE EAST, AND THEIR FINDINGS IN THAT CONTEXT HAVE BEEN ENDORSED (3) BY THE MILITARY COMMITTEE.

_

3. THE FOLLOWING GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS WERE ADDRESSED IN RESPECT OF GROUND FORCES DURING THE COURSE OF THAT WORKING GROUP STUDY:

-

(A) A GREAT DEAL OF INFORMATION ON ORGANIZATION, STRENGTH, DEPLOYMENT AND TASKS IS ALREADY AVAILABLE TO THE EAST, ALTHOUGH THE ACCURACY OF THIS INFORMATION CANNOT BE ESTABLISHED BY THE EAST, UNLESS CONFIRMED BY ALLIED MANPOWER DATA.

_

(B) NO MORE DETAILED BREAKDOWN OF MANPOWER STRENGTHS SHOULD BE GIVEN THAN IS NECESSARY TO ACHIEVE THE IMMEDIATE NEGOTIATING PURPOSE.

-

(C) IN DECIDING THE DETAILS OF ANY SELECTIVE BREAKDOWN OF NATO MANPOWER STRENGTHS WHICH COULD BE GIVEN TO THE WP IN THE COURSE OF CONFIDENTIAL DISCUSSIONS, THE "KEY" INFORMATION WHICH SHOULD NOT BE GIVEN TO THE WP IS THAT WHICH WOULD CONFIRM THE STATE OF READINESS/TRAINING OR GENERAL DEFENCE PLANS OF NATO'S COMBAT ELEMENTS, AND PARTICULARLY OF THOSE WHICH PLAY A MAJOR PART UNDER THE DETERRENCE POLICY.

-SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 NATO 08657 01 OF 04 100844Z

4. THE GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS LISTED AT PARAGRAPH 3 IN RESPECT OF GROUND FORCES APPLY EQUALLY TO CONSIDERATION OF RELEASE OF AIR MANPOWER DATA.

-

5. IT HAS BEEN BORNE IN MIND, IN THE PREPARATION OF THIS PAPER, THAT THE IMMEDIATE ALLIED OBJECTIVE IN THE TECHNICAL DATA DISCUSSIONS IS TO LOCATE PRECISELY AND QUANTIFY THE DISCREPANCIES BETWEEN WP TABLED FIGURES AND ALLIED ESTIMATES OF WP STRENGTHS. TO ENABLE VALID COMPARISON OF THE TWO SIDES' FIGURES, IT IS ESSENTIAL THAT THE EAST PROVIDE FIGURES ON NATIONAL FORCES OR IN A FORM IN WHICH NATIONAL TOTALS CAN BE RELIABLY CALCULATED. TO PROBE AND CHALLENGE EASTERN FIGURES IN DETAIL, IT MAY BE DESIRABLE FOR THE ALLIES TO OFFER TO EXCHANGE A VARIETY OF FIGURES. EACH CASE WOULD, HOWEVER, HAVE TO BE CONSIDERED ON ITS MERITS FROM THE NATO-WIDE SECURITY ASPECTS.

-

6. IT IS LIKELY THAT THE WP INTELLIGENCE IS BETTER INFORMED ON ALLIED STRENGTHS AND DISPOSITIONS OF MANPOWER THAN IS ALLIED INTELLIGENCE ON WP STRENGTHS AND DISPOSITIONS, PARTIALLY BECAUSE OF THE OPEN NATURE OF WESTERN SOCIETIES AND THE WESTERN PRACTICE OF PUBLISHING MILITARY

DATA; AND PARTIALLY BECAUSE OF THE DENSITY OF THE WP INTELLIGENCE GATHERING ORGANIZATIONS. THERE COULD, THEREFORE, BE A NET ADVANTAGE FOR THE WEST TO EXCHANGE MANPOWER DATA, WHICH WOULD NOT PREJUDICE ALLIED SECURITY, ON A RECIPROCAL BASIS WITH THE EAST.

REVIEW

7. IN THEIR EARLIER CONSIDERATION (4) OF THE MANPOWER DATA WHICH MIGHT BE RELEASED IN RESPECT OF GROUND FORCES,

SECRET

NNN

SECRET

PAGE 01 NATO 08657 02 OF 04 100851Z ACTION ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 CIAE-00 H-01 INR-07 IO-13 L-03 NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-05 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 TRSE-00 NSC-05 /085 W

P 100821Z SEP 77 FM USMISSION NATO TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 5794 SECDEF WASHDC PRIORITY INFO USDEL MBFR VIENNA USNMR SHAPE BE

SECRETSECTION 02 OF 04 NATO 08657

THE WORKING GROUP APPROACHED THE PROBLEM, WITHIN THE GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS MENTIONED AT PARAGRAPH 3 ABOVE, ON THE BASIS THAT THE GROUND FORCES OF THE ALLIANCE ARE SIMILARLY ORGANIZED IN CORPS AND DIVISIONS.

8. THIS IS NOT TRUE OF AIR FORCES. ALLIED WESTERN PARTICIPANTS' AIR FORCES IN THE AREA OF REDUCTIONS DIFFER SUBSTANTIALLY IN STRUCTURE AND UNIT ORGANIZATION. FOR EXAMPLE:

(A) THE BASIC COMBAT ELEMENTS OF SOME NATIONAL AIR FORCES ARE REFERRED TO AS "SQUADRONS", OF OTHERS AS "WINGS" (UNITS CONTAINING ONE OR MORE SQUADRONS LOCATED AT ONE OR MORE AIR BASES).

(B) THERE ARE WIDE VARIATIONS IN THE SIZE AND ORGANIZATION OF SQUADRONS AS BETWEEN NATIONS, AND AS BETWEEN ROLES.

THE WORKING GROUP EXAMINE BELOW THE MILITARY SECURITY IMPLICATIONS OF DISCLOSING AIR MANPOWER FIGURES AS FOLLOWS:

(A) MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH UNITS AND AIR BASES. SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 NATO 08657 02 OF 04 100851Z

(B) MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS, E.G., COMBAT FORMATIONS; TRAINING.

MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH UNITS/BASES

9. BOTH WING AND SQUADRON DESIGNATIONS ARE READILY IDEN-TIFIABLE BY WP INTELLIGENCE TOGETHER WITH THEIR LOCATIONS. ASSOCIATION OF DESIGNATED WINGS OR SQUADRONS WITH ASSIGNED MANPOWER FOR EACH COULD PROVIDE WP INTELLIGENCE WITH INDICATORS OR CONFIRMATION OF DIFFERENT MANNING AND THERE-FORE DIFFERENT READINESS/CAPABILITY OF WINGS OR SQUADRONS WITH THE SAME EQUIPMENT AND BASIC ROLES.

10. THE WORKING GROUP ALSO CONSIDERED THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE RELEASE OF AIR MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH AIR BASES. ALL ALLIED AIR FORCES OPERATE FROM KNOWN, FIXED LOCATIONS AND INSTALLATIONS, WITH A FEW EXCEPTIONS FOR SPECIALIZED MOBILE UNITS. THESE INSTALLATIONS, DESCRIBED HENCEFORTH AS AIR BASES IN THIS REPORT, EMBRACE BASE HEADQUARTERS, OPERATIONAL UNITS (IF APPROPRIATE), SUPPORT ELEMENTS, AND IN MANY CASES ATTACHED UNITS. FOR THE GREAT MAJORITY OF SUCH AIR BASES, DISCLOSURE OF THE AGGREGATED MANPOWER OF THE BASE, WITHOUT BREAKDOWN TO COMPONENT ELEMENTS, WOULD NOT REVEAL THE SORT OF KEY INFORMATION DISCUSSED AT PARA-GRAPHS 3(C) AND 9 ABOVE.

11. THERE ARE, HOWEVER, A FEW AIR BASES, PARTICULARLY IN THE STRIKE ROLE WHICH COMPRISE ONLY ONE COMBAT UNIT (E.G., A WING OR SQUADRON). DISCLOSURE OF THE AGGREGATED MANPOW-ER OF SUCH AN INDIVIDUAL AIR BASE COULD REVEAL THE SORT OF KEY INFORMATION RECORDED AT PARAGRAPHS 3(C) AND 9 ABOVE. THE AGGREGATED MANPOWER, ASSOCIATED WITH KNOWLEDGE OF THE SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 NATO 08657 02 OF 04 100851Z

AIR BASE'S ROLE AND COMPARED WITH OTHER AIR BASES WITH DIFFERENT TASKS, COULD PROVIDE INDICATORS AS TO ITS TASKING AND READINESS STATUS. AT THE LOWEST, THE OFFICIAL RELEASE OF AGGREGATED MANPOWER FIGURES ON SUCH AN AIR BASE COULD CONFIRM ALIEN INTELLIGENCE ASSESSMENTS, AND THUS PROVIDE INFORMATION VALUABLE TO A POTENTIAL ENEMY

12. ESSENTIALLY, THEN, THERE WOULD BE SECURITY OBJECTIONS TO THE DISCLOSURE OF MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH AIR FORCE OPERATIONAL UNITS, E.G., WINGS OR SQUADRONS, AS INDICATED AT PARAGRAPH 9 ABOVE. THERE WOULD BE NO SECURITY OBJECTIONS TO DISCLOSURE OF MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH THE GREAT MAJORITY OF AIR BASES, BUT FOR A FEW OF THOSE AIR BASES (SEE PARAGRAPH 11), THE RELEASE OF ASSOCIATED MANPOWER COULD REVEAL OR CONFIRM KEY INFORMATION ON READINESS.

MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH FUNCTIONAL ELEMENTS

13. AUTHORITY (5) HAS ALREADY BEEN GIVEN TO THE ALLIED AD HOC GROUP IN VIENNA TO OFFER AN EXCHANGE, ON A RECIPROCAL BASIS, OF AIR FORCE MANPOWER IN THE AREA OF REDUCTIONS OF THE NATIONS WHO ARE DIRECT PARTICIPANTS IN MBFR, AS FOLLOWS:

(A) AGGREGATE ALLIED AIR FORCE MANPOWER.

(B) NATIONAL MANPOWER FIGURES ASSOCIATED WITH MAJOR AIR FORMATIONS (BE TAF: GE TAC: NL TAC: UK RAFG: US AFE).

(C) OTHER ACTIVE DUTY AIR FORCE PERSONNEL

- (I) ON STAFFS OF MULTINATIONAL HEADQUARTERS (I.E.,

SECRET

NNN

SECRET

PAGE 01 NATO 08657 03 OF 04 100858Z ACTION ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 CIAE-00 EUR-12 H-01 INR-07 IO-13 L-03 NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-05 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 TRSE-00 NSC-05 /085 W

-----045412 100900Z /15

P 100821Z SEP 77 FM USMISSION NATO TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 5795 SECDEF WASHDC PRIORITY INFO USDEL MBFR VIENNA USNMR SHAPE BE

SECRETSECTION 03 OF 04 NATO 08657

- INTEGRATED MILITARY HEADQUARTERS);

- (II) OTHERS.

THERE IS NO SECURITY OBJECTION TO THE RELEASE OF THOSE MANPOWER FIGURES

-

14. THE NATIONAL MANPOWER FIGURES ASSOCIATED WITH MAJOR AIR FORMATIONS (PARAGRAPH 13(B)) IN EFFECT PROVIDE THE MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH COMBAT ELEMENTS. THESE FIGURES COULD NOT EASILY NOR LOGICALLY BE SUB-DIVIDED FURTHER EXCEPT INTO UNITS/BASES; THE IMPLICATIONS OF DISCLOSURE OF MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH UNITS/BASES ARE DISCUSSED AT PARAGRAPHS 9 TO 12 ABOVE.

_

15. OTHER ACTIVE DUTY PERSONNEL COULD, HOWEVER, BE BROKEN DOWN INTO SPECIFIC FUNCTIONAL ELEMENTS, FOR EXAMPLE, AS FOLLOWS:

_

- (A) MINISTRIES
- (B) TRAINING ESTABLISHMENTS
- (C) RECRUITING DEPOTS
- (D) BASE DEPOTS

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 NATO 08657 03 OF 04 100858Z

(E) OTHER SUPPORT SERVICES

-

THERE WOULD BE NO SECURITY OBJECTION TO THE DISCLOSURE OF MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH EACH OF THESE FUNCTIONAL SUBDIVISIONS, WHETHER ON AN ALLIED AGGREGATED OR NATIONAL BASIS.

ANOMALIES

16. SOME ALLIED AIR FORCES IN THE NGA INCLUDE ELEMENTS (E.G., AREA AIR DEFENCE: SSM UNITS: HELICOPTER UNITS FOR GROUND SUPPORT) WHICH IN OTHER ALLIED FORCES AND IN SOME WP FORCES ARE INTEGRAL ELEMENTS OF GROUND FORCES.

_

17. THESE ELEMENTS MAY BE THE SUBJECT OF SPECIAL CONSIDERATION IN NEGOTIATIONS. DISCLOSURE OF THE AGGREGATED MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH SUCH ELEMENTS ON AN ALLIANCE BASIS WOULD PROBABLY BE ACCEPTABLE IN THE CONTEXT OF A RECIPROCAL EXCHANGE WITH THE EAST. FROM THE BROADER POLITICAL AND MILITARY POINT OF VIEW, THESE ISSUES WOULD BE THE SUBJECT OF SPECIAL CONSIDERATION TO NEGOTIATIONS, AND EACH CASE WOULD NEED TO BE CONSIDERED ON ITS MERITS. DISCLOSURE OF THE ASSIGNED STRENGTH OF CERTAIN STRIKE UNITS, AIR DEFENSE (HERCULES), AND SSM (PERSHING) ORGANIZATIONS ON A NATIONAL BASIS WOULD PROVIDE THE EAST WITH INFORMATION ON THE READINESS OF NATO COMBAT UNITS WHICH PLAY A MAJOR ROLE IN NATO'S DETERRENCE POLICY. IT WOULD ALSO

NOT BE IN ACCORD WITH AC/276-D(75)9 WHICH CONCLUDED THAT DISAGGREGATION OF GROUND FORCES BELOW DIVISION LEVEL WOULD HAVE TO BE CONSIDERED ON A CASE-BY-CASE BASIS.

FINDINGS

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 NATO 08657 03 OF 04 100858Z

18. BEARING THE ABOVE IN MIND, THE WP WOULD BE UNLIKELY TO ACQUIRE NATIONAL "INTELLIGENCE" BENEFITS, TO THE DETRIMENT OF ALLIED MILITARY SECURITY, FROM RELEASE OF MANPOWER FIGURES IN THE FOLLOWING CATEGORIES:

(A) THE BREAKDOWN OF NATO GROSS AIR FORCE MANPOWER TOTALS INTO NATIONAL AIR FORCE MANPOWER FIGURES.

(B) THE SUB-DIVISION OF NATIONAL AIR MANPOWER TOTALS INTO:

- (1) MAJOR AIR FORMATIONS (AS SPECIFIED IN C-M(77)56,
- ANNEX I);
- (2) OTHER ACTIVE DUTY PERSONNEL.

(C) THE FURTHER SUB-DIVISION OF (B)(2) (OTHER ACTIVE DUTY PERSONNEL) INTO MANPOWER ALLOCATED TO:

- (1) MINISTRIES
- (2) TRAINING ESTABLISHMENTS
- (3) RECRUITING DEPOTS
- (4) BASE DEPOTS
- (5) OTHER SUPPORT SERVICES

19 ON THE OTHER HAND, DESCLOSURE OF AIR MANPOWER ASSOCIATED WITH WINGS/SQUADRONS COULD REVEAL KEY INFORMATION ON READINESS/TASKING OF COMBAT UNITS. WITH RESPECT TO AIR BASES, WHILE THE DISCLOSURE OF AGGREGATED MANPOWER ON EACH BASE WOULD NOT BE OBJECTIONABLE FOR THE GREAT MAJORITY OF AIR BASES, THERE ARE A FEW (PARTICULARLY IN THE STRIKE ROLE AND COMPRISING ONLY ONE COMBAT UNIT) WHERE SUCH DISCLOSURE COULD REVEAL OR CONFIRM KEY INFORMATION AND WOULD THEREFORE BE OBJECTIONABLE ON SECURITY GROUNDS.

20. THE WORKING GROUP HAVE REACHED THE FINDINGS RECORDED

SECRET

NNN

SECRET

PAGE 01 NATO 08657 04 OF 04 100859Z ACTION ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 CIAE-00 EUR-12 H-01 INR-07 IO-13 L-03 NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-05 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 TRSE-00 NSC-05 /085 W

P 100821Z SEP 77 FM USMISSION NATO TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 5796 SECDEF WASHDC PRIORITY INFO USDEL MBFR VIENNA USNMR SHAPE BE

S E C R E T SECTION 04 OF 04 NATO 08657

IN THE TWO PRECEDING PARAGRAPHS IN THE NARROW CONTEXT OF MILITARY SECURITY. IT IS FULLY APPRECIATED THAT THERE ARE WIDER POLITICAL AND SECURITY IMPLICATIONS TO BE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT IN DETERMINING THE EXTENT TO WHICH AIR MANPOWER SHOULD BE DISCLOSED IN NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE EAST.

21. FINALLY, THE WORKING GROUP FINDINGS AT PARAGRAPH 20 ABOVE BASED ON SECURITY IMPLICATIONS DO NOT IMPLY THAT THE WORKING GROUP BELIEVE THAT IN THE WIDER CONTEXT THERE WOULD BE ADVANTAGE FOR THE ALLIES IN A DETAILED EXCHANGE OF MANPOWER ON AIR FIRCES IN THE AREA OF REDUCTIONS. THAT JUDGEMENT WOULD NECESSARILY INVOLVE CONSIDERATIONS WIDER THAN MILITARY SECURITY AND WOULD NEED TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT INTER ALIA, THE ALLIED NEGOTIATING APPROACH AND AIMS. BEGIN FOOTNOTES:

- 1. AC/119-R(77)75, ITEM I(3)
- 2. AC/276-D(75)9
- 3. IMSWM-210-75, 12TH SEPTEMBER, 1975 REFERS
- 4. AC/276-D(75)9
- 5. C-M(77)56

END FOOTNOTES. END TEXT. BENNETT SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 NATO 08657 04 OF 04 100859Z

SECRET

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am Channel Indicators: n/a **Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED**

Concepts: MBFR Control Number: n/a

Copy: SINGLE Sent Date: 10-Sep-1977 12:00:00 am Decaption Date: 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am

Decaption Note: Disposition Action: RELEASED Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW

Disposition Date: 22 May 2009 Disposition Event:

Disposition Event:
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977NATO08657
Document Source: CORE

Document Unique ID: 00

Drafter: n/a Enclosure: n/a Executive Order: RR Errors: N/A **Expiration:**

Film Number: n/a Format: TEL From: NATO

Handling Restrictions: n/a

Image Path: ISecure: 1

Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770976/aaaacmga.tel

Line Count: 430 Litigation Code IDs: Litigation Codes: Litigation History: Locator: TEXT ON-LINE Message ID: 9e228648-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc

Office: ACTION ACDA

Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a

Page Count: 8
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 77 NATO 8508 (DTG 070918Z SEP 77)

Retention: 0

Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED Review Content Flags: Review Date: 28-Oct-2004 12:00:00 am

Review Event: Review Exemptions: n/a **Review Media Identifier:** Review Release Date: n/a Review Release Event: n/a **Review Transfer Date:** Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a

SAS ID: 1315506 Secure: OPEN Status: NATIVE

Subject: MBFR: WORKING GROUP STUDY ON SECURITY IMPLICATIONS OF RELEASE OF NATO AIR FORCES MANPOWER DATA

TAGS: PARM, NATO
To: SECSTATE WASHDC WASHDC

Type: TE

vdkvgwkey: odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/9e228648-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc

Review Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009

Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009